DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 270 769 CS 209 817

AUTHOR Fair, Jo Ellen
TITLE The Role of the African Media in Patron-Client Relations: A Preliminary Look.
PUB DATE Aug 86
NOTE 33p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication (69th, Norman, OK, August 3-6, 1986).
PUB TYPE Reports - Research/Technical (143) -- Speeches/Conference Papers (150)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Communication Research; Content Analysis; *Developing Nations; Foreign Countries; *Government Role; *Mass Media; *Mass Media Effects; *Media Research; National Programs; Newspapers; News Reporting
IDENTIFIERS *Development Communication; Ivory Coast; National Development; Nigeria; Patron Client Relationship

ABSTRACT

Noting the many difficulties in conceptualizing and analyzing development communication, this paper enriches the concept by linking it with a particular form of political, economic, and social organization common to many developing nations--the patron-client network. After a brief review of relevant communication and political science literature concerning the definition of development, development communication, and patron-client networks, the paper focuses on how patron-client ties and development communication are related as social forces in a developing nation. It then reports the findings of a small content analysis of newspapers from Nigeria and the Ivory Coast showing the amount and type of development communication news items available to African readers, and how the media's participation in the patron-client structure might influence the type of information disseminated. (FL)

**********
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
**********

ED270769

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
X This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

International Division

# The Role of the African Media in Patron-Client Relations: A Preliminary Look

by

Jo Ellen Fair

School of Journalism
Indiana University
Bloomington, IN 47405

Presented to the International Division of the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication annual conference, Norman, Oklahoma, August 1986.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Jo Ellen Fair

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

CS 209 817

Abstract

The Role of the Media in Patron-Client Relations:
A Preliminary Look

The difficulties in conceptualizing and analyzing development communication are many. Whether defined as a positive "good news" about development progress or critical examination of Third World development, development communication has come to be discussed as a means by which a country's population can be united or integrated as one.

An attempt is made here to enrich the concept of development communication by linking it with a particular form of political, economic and social organization common to many developing countries: the patron-client network.

The purpose of this study is to begin to establish theoretically the relationship between development communication and a country's patron-client network or structure. To achieve this purpose three specific propositions relating to the media and a country's patron-client structure are asserted. Generally, it is argued that development communication serves more as a protector of a country's status quo — the patron-client network — than as a champion of national integration and/or a purveyor of basic needs information.

To examine the relationship between development communication and patron-client ties, this paper begins by reviewing relevant communication and political science literature concerning the definition of development, development communication and patron-client networks. From this point, the discussion focuses on how patron-client ties and development communication are related as social forces in a developing country. Lastly, a small content analysis is undertaken of two African newspapers (Ivorian and Nigerian) newspapers for a one-week period so as to gain a preliminary understanding of the amount and type of development communication content offered to readers.

The Role of the Media in Patron-Client Relations:
A Preliminary Look

In the past two decades, much of mass communication research has focused on the social and political effects of the modern-day media. Researchers have asked questions concerning the persuasive capability of the media, the kind of power they bestow upon individuals and organizations who control or have access to them and their role in maintaining and enhancing the power of the ruling classes or elites. Despite predictions and promises (see Lerner, 1958; Rogers, 1962; Schramm, 1964) that the mass media and their content could serve as powerful, direct mobilizers and integrators of a country's population, many Third World government leaders and journalists have been reluctant to accept traditional forms of Western libertarian communication. To these leaders and journalists, development communication and development news are better suited — at least philosophically — to the reporting of a country's development process.

Increasingly in the study of national development[1] and communication, development communication has come to be discussed, and in some circles celebrated, as a means by which a country's population can be united or integrated as one. Unlike earlier positions taken on the powerful effects of the mass media and their content, proponents of development communication seems less likely to assume that the development of the media as well as the dissemination of any kind of information, including development news, is beneficial to a country's population. Rather, development communication has been discussed as a form of communication

that produces process-oriented, analytical news. Such news, in theory at least, should provide detailed information that can be used by policymakers to plan development projects and by individuals to understand the complexities of development. The ultimate goal of development communication[2] is to provide development-related information that will enable a country's population to fulfill basic needs.[3]

Whether development communication is defined as positive "good news" about development progress or critical examination of Third World development, government leaders and journalists believe it is much needed. Yet, the difficulties in conceptualizing and analyzing development communication/news are many. Frequently in research, particular institutions, groups or individuals are singled out and studied in isolation. In communication research, the political, economic and/or social structures and institutions within which the media operate or interact often are neglected (Halloran, 1980, p. 141). The result of such neglect is that the media (and their content) are examined as if they existed in a vacuum — affecting no other political, economic or social institutions and in turn, being affected by none. Thus, an attempt is made to enrich the concept of development communication by linking it with a particular form of political, economic and social organization common to, if not prevalent in, many developing societies: the patron-client network.

Specifically, the purpose of this paper is to begin to establish theoretically the relationship between development communication and a country's patron-client network or structure. To achieve this purpose, three propositions are asserted.

First: It is argued that a country's mass media organizations and the content they produce and diffuse are part of that country's patron-client structure.

Second: Media content, in the form of development communication, will serve to protect and sustain a country's patron-client structure rather than disseminate basic needs information.

Third: Explanative information, which is fundamental to enabling readers to comprehend their particular country's development problems, will likely appear infrequently in development communication/news stories.

To examine these last two propositions, development communication/news items in two African (Ivorian and Nigerian) newspapers are content analyzed and compared in terms of the amount and extent to which explanative information is given to readers. However, before further elaborating these propositions and methodology of the content analysis, it is necessary first to examine the key definitions and attributes of patron-client networks and the proposition concerning the role of the mass media and development communication in those clientelistic structures.

## Definitions and Characteristics of Patron-Client Relations

Though during the late 1950s and early 1960s the study of patron-client relations was marginal, the terms patronage, political clientelism or patron-client relations/network since then have begun to appear more frequently in the research literature of anthropology, sociology, and political science (Weingrod, 1968, p. 377; Eisenstadt & Roniger, 1981, p. 271). By and large, it seems that the study of patron-client relations has tended to focus either on micro-level analyses of informal, small-group interactions or macro-level analyses of complex organizations and/or political systems (Lemarchand & Legg, 1972, p. 15; Eisenstadt & Roniger, 1981, p. 271). Anthropologists and sociologists generally have concentrated their works of clientage relations on kinship, "corporate"

and territorial groups. Though classical sociologists such as Max Weber (1964) and Georg Simmel (1950) began to explore what Weber called patrimonialism and Simmel labeled "the schema of gaining and returning the equivalence," it is political scientists who have emphasized the modern, rational bureaucratic and market frameworks (Roth, 1968, pp. 194-197; Lemarchand & Legg, 1972, pp. 149-151; Eisenstadt & Roniger, 1981, pp. 271-273).

Anthropological and sociological examinations of patron-client relations can be distinguished generally from their political science counterparts by their concentration on particular personal relationships and dyadic exchanges occurring in village societies. Despite this basic similarity among patron-client studies, the patron-client concept can be analyzed at several levels of abstraction. Consider, for example, James Scott's definition of patron-client ties:

> The patron-client relationship — an exchange relationship between roles — may be defined as a special case of dyadic (two-person) ties involving a largely instrumental friendship in which an individual of higher socioeconomic status (patron) uses his own influence and resources to provide protection or benefits, or both, for a person of lower status (client) who, for his part, reciprocates by offering general support and assistance, including personal services, to the patron (1972, p. 92).

It is clear from this definition that the author assumes that patron-client relations can be successfully characterized and identified. At the most concrete level, Scott's definition emphasizes the inequality of power between patron and clients and the personal, affective and reciprocal character of social ties. However, his definition also illustrates the varying degrees of abstraction that the concept of patron-client relations encompasses. Proceeding from the abstract to the concrete, Scott's definition, which itself is derived from several anthropological and

sociological studies, includes the reciprocity and exchange of influence, (political) allegiance and specific benefits. Thus, these varying levels of abstraction suggest meaningful boundaries to the term patron-client relations. Primarily, this range of possible meanings indicates that the patron-client relationship cab be applied to many, quite different contexts.

From a synthesis of several anthropological and sociological studies,[4] the patron-client relationship can be defined as a specific dyadic exchange. It is distinguishable by the following characteristics: (1) The relationship is asymmetrical. That is, it occurs between and among groups and individuals who are unequal in power, status and wealth and thus are able to command resources, including information, in an unequal fashion; (2) There is a quality of face-to-face, personal, affective and/or reciprocal relations between members/participants in the patron-client network; (3) The personal, affective nature of the exchanges between individuals indicates that it is particularistic/private and thus only slightly influenced by public laws or community norms; (4) The continuing nature of reciprocal exchange suggests long-term obligations and expectation.

In contrast to the highly personalized and affective sense in which anthropologists and sociologists use the term, the patron-client relation in the vocabulary of political scientists suggests a change in the level at which the network or ties are examined. In the parlance of political science, patron-clientage refers to bureaucratic relationships, the norms of rationality, anonymity and universalism (Lemarchand & Legg, 1972, p. 151; Kaufman, 1974, pp. 284-287). From a political science perspective, the patron-client exchange becomes central to understanding how political

systems, constituting the basis for interest articulation and socio-political control, work (Kaufman, 1974, p. 285). Similar to micro-level studies, the patron-client structure illuminates a mode of association, however imperfect and asymmetrical it may be, between and among individuals, groups and organizations.

Though not meant to be an exact replica of the micro-level, concrete clientelistic networks, the macro-level studies of institutions, bureaucracies or states reveal the long-term, unequal characteristics and relationships derived from the behavior of individual patrons and clients. Borrowing its theoretical basis from anthropological and sociological approaches to patron-client relations, political science studies have focused on the way in which national leaders, officials and/or bureaucrats have distributed and exchanged particular resources such as jobs or special favors for continued support (Weingrod, 1968, p. 379). The small, local community is linked with the larger political, economic and social institutions/organizations through the process of state centralization and market expansion (Powell, 1970, p. 413). Yet, at issue in both micro- and macro-level analyses of patron-client relations is, in Lasswellian terms, "who gets what, when and how?"

Whether the level of analysis is micro or macro, patron-client links are established and perpetuated in developing countries as a means of exploring benefits, information, goods or services. These patron-client ties are cultivated between and among groups unequal in status, power and wealth. Moreover, within a country's patron-client structure exists two networks: major and minor. The participants in the major network of the patron-client system are government leaders, investors, bureaucrats, the military and their associates in middle-class groups and labor unions.

These individuals gain political power and wealth from the system, allowing patrons to increase their "comparative advantage" over their clients. To survive, the major network depends on the support of the minor network, which consists of middle-echelon patrons. Below the major and minor networks is the mass of a country's population (Gamer, 1982, pp. 100-170).

**The Role of the Mass Media in Patron-Client Relations**

Generally, the participation of the mass media — the institutions, personnel and content — in the patron-client structure has been ignored by scholars interested in clientelism. The role of the mass media in patron-client networks would be of greatest interest to macro-level analysis since it is at this level that institutions and organizations such as the military and government are analyzed. By contrast, such an analysis undertaken at the micro- or individual-level may reveal only dispersed or disparate patterns of media use by individual members of patron-client networks. For this reason, a micro-level analysis at this beginning stage of assessing the media role's in the patron-client system indeed would be difficult.

Typically, when mass communication has been mentioned in conjunction with patron-client networks, it has been perceived not as part of the structure but as an "environmental" or input factor influencing the local distribution of resources and the integration or interpenetration of regions into national societies (Kaufman, 1972, p. 293). To recall the first proposition stated earlier, it is argued here that media organizations do more than facilitate the distribution of resources. Indeed, they can and should be considered as part of the patron-client system's major network. Three reasons can be advanced to explain why this

is so. The first two reasons involve the technology and content of the media. Though not speaking directly of the mass media, Rene Lemarchand and Keith Legg (1972, p. 158) state that technology and changes in technology serve to reinforce the positions of pre-existent patrons. First, because the media organization controls its own technology, its interests are more closely aligned with other technology-controlling institutions in the major network of the patron-client system. Second, because these media organizations have access to and control over technology, likewise they can influence the format and type of content disseminated. This control of information, Nathaniel Leff argues, also serves to shape consensus among members of the major network (1968, pp. 118-131). The third, and most important, reason that these organizations may be considered as participants in the major network is because of their close, and often symbiotic, relationship with other institutions within the network. Thus, the media perform three primary functions in society: They inform people about their social, economic, political and cultural environment; they serve as a link between various groups and institutions of society; and they transmit social norms and values (Lasswell, 1948, p. 38). Moreover, communication research has demonstrated that no matter how "independent" (legally or economically) a media organization seems, strong influence from government, labor and business sectors remain (Sigal, 1973; Elliott & Golding, 1974, pp. 229-254; Altschull, 1984).

Although the media may depend upon institutions such as those in the government to provide material to fill newspapers or broadcasts, these same institutions, especially government, rely on the media to disseminate messages to a large number of media users. As the distinctions, for example, between government agencies and autonomous media organizations

are blurred, media organizations often are controlled directly by the government. At the very least, they are heavily influenced by government desires (Vasquez, 1983, pp. 265-281; Wilcox, 1975, pp. 4-60; Altschull, 1984, pp. 143-169). Today, it seems nearly impossible to conceive of politics without the media. The media, especially in developing countries, transmit and magnify actions so as to create popular support or maintain the state's legitimacy/control (Mytton, 1983, p. 8). As Lucian Pye notes: "Without a network capable of enlarging and magnifying the works and choices of individuals, there could be no politics capable of spanning the nation" (1963, p. 6). Following Pye's lead then, the development of the channels of mass communication seem to be a necessary condition to preserving the existing political structure, including patron-client ties. Therefore, because of the direct and pervasive influence, interaction or involvement of media organizations with other, mainly governmental, institutions in the patron-client system as well as their control over technology and content, it seems likely that the media play more than an environmental role in patron-client ties.

It must be added that whether studying the mass media or any other institution or organization at the macro- or national-level, there are limitations (Sartori, 1970, pp. 1033-1053; Kaufman, 1974, pp. 284-308; Lemarchand, 1981, pp.7-32). As Giovanni Sartori cautions, "Climbing the ladder of abstraction" is often difficult and/or risky. Such climbing can lead to "conceptual stretching or conceptual straining, i.e., to vague, amorphous conceptualizing"; in the worse scenario, it may lead into a "Hegelian night in which all cows are black (and eventually the milkman is taken for the cow)" (1970, pp. 1034,1040). Still, the consensus among researchers interested in patron-client ties seems to indicate that the

endeavor to link and examine institutions at the national level is worthwhile as such an attempt helps to elucidate the nexus of interactions between and among domestic institutions and/or regions (Kaufman, 1970; Powell, 1970; Flynn, 1974; Lande, 1977; Lemarchand, 1981; and Eisenstadt & Roniger, 1981).

The approach taken here to attempt to resolve the level of analysis limitation is to ascribe to institutions such as the mass media and the government the structural characteristics of the patron-client model. From this perspective, patterns of unequal interaction (or dependency, as it is sometimes called) between institutions and/or regions can be viewed as an extension of the basic micro-level patron-client dyad (Lemarchand, 1981, p.14). Here, the concern is not with individuals outside of the overall patron-client structure or with individuals in the media or other patron-client networks such as government or business. Rather, the primary concern is with the aggregation of individual behavior manifested in the actions and interactions between institutions (such as the media and government) in the patron-client structure. The patron-client structure, including mass media institutions, appears here as a paradigm for explaining vertical power relations; that is, this patron-client structure (and its institutions) is treated as a constant attribute of complex national systems. To compare the patron-client structures, then, it is necessary to distinguish among the types of institutions comprising the patron-client structure rather than the degree of clientelism. The focus, generally, is on the relationship between a state's media and government. Moreover, because media output/content is produced and disseminated by a participant of the patron-client structure (the media organization), content can be and is viewed as a dependent variable in the

system as it helps in the resurgence and maintenance of patron-client ties (Flynn, 1974, p. 139; Kaufman, 1974, p. 302; Lemarchand, 1981, p. 12).

As proposed earlier, it is argued that media content, in the form of development communication, is likely to:

(1) serve as a protector of a country's status quo — the patron-client structure — rather than as a champion of national integration and/or a purveyor of basic needs information.

(2) contain little "explanative" information, which would enable media users or individuals exposed to media content to learn about and act upon development problems confronting them.

Method

It has been suggested that because a country's media organizations are participants in the patron-client structure, development communication content produced and disseminated by those organizations will likely reflect the media's "interests" perpetuating patron-client relations. To attempt to support empirically the propositions concerning the nature of development communication,[5] the content analysis method was used. Two West African newspapers — Nigeria's Daily Times and the Ivory Coast's Fraternite Matin — were selected for analysis. Both media organizations operate in free market-type economies and yet represent philosophical differences in government control and press freedom. Based on the availability of newspapers, the time period studied was a six-day publishing week, May 21-26, 1984. Although a longer period of analysis would have been preferable methodologically, it is argued that patterns of news coverage supporting the development communication propositions would emerge or at least not vary substantially from one time period to another. The number of articles analyzed was 60.[6]

The coding scheme for the content analysis included measures for the type and nationality of sources used, the topics covered, the article's

setting (e.g., international, national, urban, rural), the size of the news story in proportion to the news page, the proportion of development communication articles carried in the newspaper, the overall tone of the story, whether the story compares the subject with government claims, examines the relevance of the subject to the needs of the country's population, describes a specific development project or proposes a solution to a development problem. Since these variables are not central to the examination of the study's propositions, this part of the analysis will combine development communication content featured in both Fraternite Matin and the Daily Times. By aggregating the newspapers' coverage, a more general background of development communication can be provided.

Additionally, because the aim of the content analysis is to examine the relationship between development communication and patron-client ties, measures were developed for coding "substantive" explanation, which is information that readers may use to learn about and act upon development problems. Measures of "substantive" explanation comprised coding whether a development communication item asked if a development project/program was needed, explained why the country was faced with particular development problems, indicated who benefited (e.g., government officials, landowners, shopkeepers) from development projects, mentioned the effects of development problems or projects at different levels (e.g., individual or country) and attempted to link development problems or projects with others occurring within the country or other developing countries.[7] At this stage of the analysis, comparison of the two newspapers is done to discover whether the role those newspapers play in their country's patron-client system affects the amount and type of explanative information offered to readers. Furthermore, it should be noted that the content

analysis method is limited in that it reveals just what the media have published; audience characteristics and use of media content are left unspecified. Therefore, findings generated from the content analysis cannot be generalized beyond the propositions' scope.

**The Role of the Media in Nigeria and the Ivory Coast**

How independent the media and their content are of government control or regulation depends upon a country's political and historical tradition. News, produced and disseminated by media organizations, plays an important role in modern society in that it reflects political and economic structures and cultural expressions (Elliott & Golding, 1974, p. 230; Habte, 1983, p. 96; Mytton, 1983, p. 131). As Philip Elliott and Peter Golding point out, "News is not simply a collection of raw facts about the world... ." (1974, p. 230).

Indeed, the relationship between the media and social and political structures in the Ivory Coast and Nigeria is close. In both countries, the media and their news content have been central to the governments' efforts to strengthen national identity (Martin, 1983, pp. 238-241). Since achieving their independence, Nigeria and the Ivory Coast have pursued national development goals that have concentrated on economic development. Nigeria has focused its efforts on oil production, while the Ivory Coast has concentrated on agricultural products.

The history of the media in Nigeria is also the history of Nigerian nationalism. Frank Ugboajah writes that during the independence movement editors and nationalists were wedded as one and leading journalists were nearly always leading nationalists (1980, p. 135). Throughout the 1970s, the Nigerian government, perhaps recalling the success of the media in

mobilizing Nigerians toward independence, called upon the media to produce news to provide Nigerians with:

> ... strong and efficient information media to achieve the ends of fostering national reconciliation in the aftermath of a civil war, mobilizing public support for the effectiveness of national development and presently balanced, unbiased and timely information about conditions in the country (Ministry of Economic Development and Reconstruction, 1975, p. 60).

However, it may be too early to tell whether, or the extent to which, Major General Ibrahim Babangida's administration will continue to use the media as mobilizers and integrators.

Perhaps because the Ivory Coast, when compared with Nigeria, has suffered from much less internal discord since its independence, the Ivorian media do not share the Nigerian tradition of "journalist as nationalist." Still, the media are perceived by the Ivorian government, and in particular by President Felix Houphouet-Boigny, as key to ensuring political stability and economic development. Houphouet-Boigny in a 1974 press conference outlined his view of the media's role in the Ivory Coast.

> Our single party [the Parti Democratique de Cote d'Ivoire] is a necessity of the moment. Everyone must serve this single party: the president, the legislature, the judiciary, the administrative authorities, the privileged, workers, peasants, the young and old, also — why not — the press (1980, pp. 175-176).

Moreover, the president concluded, the media must continue to "denounce areas that don't work well, but [they] must also propose solutions. ... [The media] must carry on an active participation in the definition of political objectives" (1980, pp. 67-68).

Earlier, it was asserted that the mass media because of their close and often symbiotic relationship with governments could be considered as participants in a country's patron-client structure. Certainly, the

official government views of the role of the media summarized here support this case. The ownership and regulation patterns of the media also suggest strong media-government ties. These patterns of ownership and control become important to understanding the role of the media and development communication in patron-client structures in that governments that own and/or control the media likewise can exert influence on the media's production and diffusion of content.

From a synthesis of several studies of African media, Amde-Michael Habte found that generally the media perform three basic functions: The mass media serve to orchestrate messages of the central government, create a sense of national unity and mobilize the population for social and economic development (1980, p. 106). The media perform these functions because of strong government influence and control (Habte, 1983, p. 99). Thus, the content of the media in the Ivory Coast and Nigeria has tended to be dominated by government exhortation and demand (Mytton, 1983, p. 132).

In the Ivory Coast, Fraternite Matin is the only daily newspaper. It is also the official (PDIC) newspaper, owned and operated by the Ivorian government (Kurian, 1982, p. 1075). In fact, the newspaper's directeur general (the equivalent to the publisher) is Amadou Thiam, who also serves as the Minister of Information. As for the Nigerian media, the government controls roughly 60 percent of the stock in the country's largest and most influential newspaper, the Daily Times (Nwankwo & Kurian, 1983, p. 690).[8] Moreover, in both countries, a series of controls exist that further constrain the media and their content. In the Ivory Coast, the government allocates newsprint as well as reviews content prior to publication. Similarly, the media are constrained in Nigeria in that they are licensed

by the government, and journalists can be detained and/or fined for criticizing the government. In both countries, the governments directly subsidize the media as well as ban opposition publications (Wilcox, 1975, pp. 122-123).

Generally, the Ivorian and Nigerian governments view the media and their content as a means by which their countries can be united. It follows, then, if the media are perceived as posing any threat to the government or to an existing order such as the patron-client structure, they and their content will be curbed. However, it should be noted that attempting to assess the role of the media in developing countries is difficult, for such an endeavor is inevitably culture-bound.

The tradition of Western, and particularly U.S., research is to regard the role of the media as one of opposition. In developing countries such as the Ivory Coast and Nigeria, governments assert what are referred to as "positive" controls over the media with the view that these controls will serve a larger end — national development. Yet, philosophically, from a Western perspective, any control over the media is negative. Hence, examinations of "foreign" media systems and their content must be carefully approach so that the biases and assumptions made about, for instance, media and development communication in relation to a country's patron-client system, can be understood and acknowledged.

Findings

It must be emphasized that the purpose of the content analysis of Fraternite Matin and the Daily Times is not merely to examine development communication articles but to begin to understand how the media's participation in the patron-client structure might influence the type of information disseminated. Clearly, the Ivorian and Nigerian governments' official statements concerning the role of the media as well as the ownership and regulation patterns existing in those countries indicate strong ties between governments and media organizations; because of these close ties, media organizations can be considered members of a country's patron-client system. Following this reasoning, development communication content, which is produced by the patron-client network's media organization, serves only to perpetuate the system within which it is disseminated. Thus, it has been proposed that development communication content will neglect basic needs information and will offer readers few "substantive" explanations of development projects and problems.

To recall, the goal of development communication is to provide information for the achievement or attainment of basic needs. However, development communication may differ widely in its published form from its theoretical goal. Thus, it may be the case that the "practiced" form of development communication gives media users only information pertaining to the "who, what, when and where" of a development project, policy or problem. This kind of information means that such stories may tell readers that their national leader visited a new farming project in a particular region on a particular day. The element missing from these news stories may be substantive explanations why such a project was needed and for whose benefit.

It may very well be that development communication articles are more likely to address "administrative" kinds of information concerning the construction of a road or hospital, thereby neglecting explanations of problems such as landlessness, poverty and inequality. The content analysis is used here as a method for determining the extent to which development communication content appearing in the Ivorian and Nigerian newspapers provides basic needs information and/or explanations of development problems to those countries' populations. However, before discussing and comparing the content analysis findings relating directly to the amount of substantive explanation found in each newspaper's development communication articles, a composite description of the amount and type of communication content found in both Fraternite Matin and the Daily News is offered.

Description of Development Communication Content. Development communication content has been described as news written in news-feature style, which carries analysis. A total of 60 stories, an average of five stories per day per newspaper, was coded as development communication during the six-day period. Fraternite Matin carried 35 development communication stories, while the Daily Times contained 25. Most of the stories (74.4%) included a photograph or illustration. Feature news stories, which best fit the description of development communication, were found 66.7 percent of the time, while event-oriented news was found 33.3 percent of the time.

News analysis should require a relatively long story. Indeed, it was found that about 38 percent of the stories took up one-fourth to one-half of a page in space; additionally, it was found that about 18 percent of the stories took up more than one-half of a page. In 48 percent of the

cases, the overall proportion of development communication content to all other news stories appearing in the two newspapers was between one-eighth and one-fourth. As measured by their size and placement in the newspapers, development communication articles were given medium priority about 62 percent of the time. Nearly all of the stories (98.2%) were written by home providers — the newspaper's readers, own reporters or national news agency. The stories were largely national in focus (45%), but 26.7 percent were predominantly about rural development, while only three percent of the stories took an urban focus. The remainder of stories (23.3%) were foreign news stories, in which Nigeria or the Ivory Coast were involved.

As for sources used, most stories (81.3%) relied on only live or human sources as opposed to documents (4.2%; 14.6% of the stories used a combination of human sources (43.5%). However, government sources were cited most frequently as the first or primary source in 65.2 percent of the stories. Perhaps because of the reliance on government sources, the use of critical sources and the tone of the story indicate a deference to the government versions of an issue or problem. In 83.3 percent of the stories, no critical sources were used. The tone the stories took also reflects their non-critical nature in that 36.7 percent of the stories were neutral and 45 percent were positive.

Analysis of the development topic by comparison of the present situation with (a project/policy's) original goals, accomplishments in other developing countries or comparison of a project/policy's outcome with government claims for success was limited, with responses ranging from 15 to 35 percent. However, 80 percent of the stories did examine the relevance of the subject/issue to local needs. A nearly even split

occurred between stories that did and did not examine a specific development problem and propose a solution to it. In 51.7 percent of the cases, no problem or solution was addresses, while in 48.3 percent of the cases problems and solutions were discussed.

Analysis of Explanative Development Communication Content. It has been proposed that the explanative dimension of development communication content is vital to enabling a country's population to learn about and act upon the complexities of development problems. If such information were neglected, the argument is, development communication content would be serving the interests of the patron-client structure rather than acting as a champion of national integration and/or a purveyor of basic needs information. From the analysis of explanative information contained in Fraternite Matin and the Daily Times, it was found that the development communication content carried few explanations of development projects or problems and their effects.

Specifically, the coverage of actual development projects such as literacy campaigns or the construction of a school was found in only 10 (29%) of Fraternite Matin's 35 development communication articles and in only four (16%) of the Daily Times' 25 stories. Discussion or explanation of the need for and benefits of projects/campaigns was offered in four (40%) of Fraternite's 10 articles and in two of four (50%) articles in the Times. Yet, if a country's development goal is to increase the literacy rate, it may be that explanations of the necessity for or beneficial nature of literacy can facilitate acceptance of these projects.[9]

In terms of explanations offered of general development problems facing either the Ivory Coast or Nigeria, only 11.4 percent of Fraternite

stories, compared with 20 percent of the Times stories, supplied this information. Moreover, in both Fraternite Matin and the Daily Times, only eight (13.3% of the total 60) articles described who would benefit from development projects, programs or policies. Each newspaper carried four of these articles. The beneficiaries mentioned were women (twice in the Times), villagers (twice in Fraternite) students/children (once in Fraternite) and every citizen of the country (once in the Times).

Development communication stories also were analyzed to discover whether stories mentioned in any of the immediate effects that development projects or problems might have on individuals, the country or both. Fraternite Matin featured nine of these articles, of which five referred to individuals as most likely to be affected, while three examined effects on both the individual and the country, and one story looked at effects on the country. By contrast, the Daily Times carried eight such stories, of which four were focused on individuals, three examines effects on the country, and one referred to both individuals and the country.

Lastly, it was found that the two newspapers combined carried only six articles that attempted to link development problems, projects or policies with others occurring within the country or in other developing countries. Four of these articles were found in Fraternite Matin. In the Daily Times' case, both articles mentioned problems occurring within the country.

Discussion

This research can be viewed as a building block for understanding the role of the media and development communication in the patron-client structure. Though the findings cannot fully verify the propositions, they can indicate some support. Even though the sample sizes are really too small to allow any meaningful comparison to be made of the explanative information offered in Fraternite Matin and the Daily Times, the finding that stands out most is the lack of explanative information.[10] In theory at least, the Nigerian media have had a history of less direct government control than is the case in the Ivory Coast; yet, this philosophical difference seems to have had little influence on the type and amount of explanative information given in the Daily Times, expect that the Nigerian newspaper carried slightly more explanations of general development problems than its Ivorian counterpart. Thus, perhaps because the Ivorian and Nigerian governments have had and continue to have such powerful influence or control over their countries' media organizations and content, it should not be surprising that the explanative dimension of development communication was neglected.

As a consequence of neglecting explanations of national development projects, policies or problems, the media, through their production and dissemination of development communication, may serve to sustain and reinforce patron-client relationships, in which individuals who possess land, wealth or power can exert their influence and benefit from the 'underdevelopment' of others. Information — and by no means is this argument intended to be of the "powerful effects" variety — explaining, interpreting or analyzing the reasons for poverty, inequality or landlessness may be one way a country's population can begin to deal with

or understand the complexities of its national development. In a sense this paper has challenged the linear notion of development; that is, the view that the development and emergence of the media as well as the dissemination of any kind of development communication is beneficial to a country's population.

The approach taken here to establish and examine the relationship between development communication and patron-client ties has concentrated on macro-level institutions: the Nigerian and Ivorian governments and media. It has been argued that the media can be considered as participants in a country's patron-client systems primarily because of their intimate ties with the government as well as their control over technology and production of content. Certainly, the Nigerian and Ivorian governments' official statements regarding the media as well as the patterns of ownership and control help to support this proposition. Once it was established that the media could be considered as participants in their country's patron-client system, two assertions were made regarding development communication. It was posited that because these patron-type media organizations produced development content, this content would reflect the patron-client structure's interests and thus would contain little basic needs and explanative information. The data from the content analysis of Fraternite Matin and the Daily Times indicate support for these assertions.

This study's approach to understanding the role of the media and their content in the patron-client system certainly is not the only way to examine clientelistic relationships. The comparison of macro- and micro-level approaches illustrates how the choice of a level of analysis determines the role media organizations and their development

communication content play in the patron-client structure. The patron-client concept has evolved from a melange of anthropological, sociological and political science traditions. Here, the approach borrowed from political science literature, which has tended to focus on the way in which officials, bureaucracies and organizations distributed and exchanged goods, services and/or information. This type of analysis, however, only reveals at a general/abstract level the continuous and asymmetrical relationships existing between and among organizations.

The relationship between development communication and the patron-client system can be studied at the micro-level, using anthropological and sociological perspectives. There is, of course, a distinct change in scope or focus. In this type of analysis, the focus would shift from examining the relationship of media organizations and their content with other patron-type institutions (such as government) to looking at how individual patrons and clients, either acting alone or within organizations, produce, disseminate or make use of their media's development communication content to articulate their demands or interests. The difficulty with approaching the role of development communication in the patron-client structure from a sociological or anthropological perspective may be in observing the individual media user or producers' behaviors. However, if this difficulty is overcome, the benefit of this type of analysis is accounting of individual patron and client behavior toward the production or use of development communication content. The content analysis method, as a macro-level method, limited to the extent that it can describe only what is published but not how the information is gathered or used.

Whether the approach taken is macro or micro, the patron-client framework provides the basis for a network of reciprocities between organizations and/or individuals who have access to and control over resources and those without such privileges. Thus, if media organizations and the development communication content they produce are ever to reach the potential as genuine tools of national development, the content analysis findings indicate that development communication content must provide greater explanations of development projects, policies and problems. Paradoxically, it may be the case that the success media organizations — as participants in the patron-client system — achieve in promoting national development may lead to the decline or disintegration of the patron-client structure as clients and peasants gain development-related information upon which they can act. Yet, as long as the media remain within a country's patron-client structure, development communication will retain its present form and patron-client relations will continue to be served.

## Notes

[1]National development is defined as follows: a process by which a country works toward relative economic self-reliance but maturity. Self-reliance is characterized by heterogeneous but cooperative sectors of the economy operating efficiently to meet the needs of a majority of a country's population, while maturity refers to an economy able to interrelate with other countries on the basis of equality.

[2]One difficulty with the concept of development communication and development news is that literacy rates in developing countries are sufficiently low that information published in newspapers (or other forms of the print media) cannot and is not widely circulated. However, because radio is fairly widespread in most developing countries, development news may be well circulated. In addition, development news may also be spread by word of mouth, from those individuals who have access to print/broadcast media.

[3]A country's basic needs might include: culture, education, medicine, nutrition, shelter, health, transportation, telecommunication, employment, political participation, equitable distribution of resources and integration into a larger (national) community.

[4]The synthesis includes studies from the following authors: See: Blau (1967, pp. 19-32); Boissevain (1966, p. 18); Campbell (1966, p. 260); Eisenstadt & Roniger (1981, pp. 276-278); Gamer (1982, pp. 103-120); Gellner (1977, p. 4); Kaufman (1974, p. 285); Lande (1977, pp. xv,xx-xxix); Lemarchand (1972, pp. 68-69,72-77); Lemarchand & Legg (1972, pp.151-156); Lemarchand (1981, pp. 15-17); Mayer (1966, pp. 113-114); Powell (1970, pp. 411-413); Scott (1972, pp. 92-95); Weingrod (1968, pp.377-381); Wolf (1977, pp. 174-177). For complete citations, see the reference section.

[5]The development communication content analysis included: news stories, feature articles, photography, illustrations or a combination thereof. Editorials, comics, sports, crime news, politics, letters, announcements and obituaries were excluded from the analysis. News stories are differentiated from feature stories in that news or spot stories have a definite time element, while features do not.

[6]It should be recalled that this study is a preliminary examination of the ties between the media and the patron-client structure. Thus, only two newspapers were selected for analysis; the purpose of the analysis largely is illustrative.

[7]To meet the requirements of exclusivity, reliability and validity of categories in the content analysis, a coder reliability test was conducted using a randomly selected 10 percent sample (N=6) of development communication articles appearing in Fraternite Matin and the Daily Times. A coefficient of reliability, using Holsti's composite reliability formula, was found to be .90. See Holsti (1969, pp. 135-137).

[8]It should be noted that information relating to control and/or regulation of the media since Major General Babangida's rise to power could not be found. In general, recent, systematic data analysis and information about the media in Africa are lacking.

[9]It should be noted that by merely explaining the necessity for or benefit of a particular project, individuals will not accept and change their behaviors in accordance with the government's development goals. However, the media and their content can only provide information. Often it is the case that entitlements to goods and services must be increased before individuals will change their behavior patterns.

[10]A charge could be made that because the newspapers chosen for analysis have such close ties with the government, conclusions concerning the lack of explanative information are "pre-determined." To counter, it is argued that no matter how independent the media are of government interference (either politically or economically), media organizations may share with the government certain values or interests (particularly economic), which serve to maintain them both.

## References


Altschull, J.H. (1984). Agents of power. New York: Longman.

Blau, P. (1967). Exchange and power in social life. New York: Wiley.

Boissevain, J. (1966). Patronage in Sicily. Man: The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute, 1, 1, 18-33.

Campbell, J.K. (1960). Honour, family and patronage. Oxford: Claredon Press.

Eisenstadt, S.N. & L. Roniger. (1981). The study of patron-client relations and recent developments in sociological theory. In S.N. Eisenstadt & R. Lemarchand (Eds.), Political clientelism, patronage and development (pp. 271-287). Beverly Hills: Sage Publications.

Elliott, P. & P. Golding. (1974). Mass communication and social change: the imagery of development and the development of imagery. In E. de Kadt & G. Williams (Eds.), Sociology and development (pp. 229-254). London: Tavistock Publishers.

Flynn, P. (1974). Class, clientelism and coercion: some mechanisms of internal dependency and control. Journal of Commonwealth and Comparative Politics, 12, 2, 133-153.

Gamer, R. (1982). The developing nations. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, Inc.

Gellner, E. (1977). Patrons and clients. In E. Gellner & J. Waterbury (Eds.), Patrons and clients (pp. 1-7). London: Gerald Duckworth and Co.

Habte, A.-M. (1983). The mass media role in the third world. In J.L. Martin & A. Chaudhary (Eds.), Comparative mass media systems (pp. 95-110). New York: Longman.

Holsti, O. (1969). Content analysis for the social sciences and humanities. Reading, Mass.: Addison-Wesley Publications.

Kaufman, R. (1974, June). The patron-client concept and macro-politics: prospects and problems. Comparative Studies in Society and History, 16, 3, 284-308.

Kurian, G. (Ed.). (1982). The Ivory Coast. World press encyclopedia (pp. 1075-1077). New York: Facts on File.

Lande, C. (1977). Introduction: the dyadic basics of clientelism. In S. Schmidt, L. Guasti, C. Lande & J. Scott (Eds.), Friends, followers and factions (pp. xiii-xxxvii). Berkeley: University of California Press.

Laswell, H. (1948). The structure and function of communication and society. In L. Bryson (Ed.), The communication of ideas (pp. 37-51). New York: Institute for Religions and Social Sciences.

Leff, N. (1968). Economic policy-making and development in Brazil 1947-1964. New York: Wiley Co.

Lemarchand, R. & K. Legg. (1972, January). Political clientelism and development. Comparative Politics, 4, 2, 149-178.

Lemarchand, R. (1972, March). Political clientelism and ethnicity in tropical Africa: competing solidarities in nation-building. American Political Science Review, 66, 68-91.

Lemarchand, R. (1981). Comparative political clientelism: structure, process and optic. In S.N. Eisenstadt & R. Lemarchand (Eds.), Political clientelism, patronage and development (pp. 7-32). Beverly Hills: Sage Publications.

Lerner, D. (1958). The passing of traditional society. New York: Free Press.

Martin, J.L. (1983). The world's regions and journalism: Africa. In J.C. Merrill (Ed.), Global journalism (pp. 190-248). New York: Longman.

Mayer, A. (1966). Quasi-groups in the study of complex societies. In M. Banton (Ed.), The social anthropology of complex societies (pp. 97-122). New York: Praeger.

Ministry of Economic Development and Reconstruction. (1975). Guidelines for the third national development plan 1975-1980. Lagos: Government Printers.

Mytton, G. (1983). Mass communication in Africa. London: Edward Arnold Publishers.

Nwankwo, R. & G. Kurian. (1982). Nigeria. In G. Kurian (Ed.), World press encyclopedia (pp. 687-697). New York: Facts on File.

Powell, J.D. (1970). Peasant society and clientelism politics. American Political Science Review, 64, 411-425.

(Le) President Houphouet-Boigny et la nation ivoirienne. Abidjan: Les Nouvelles Editions Africaines.

Pye, L. (1963). Communications and political development. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Rogers, E. (1962). The diffusion of innovations. New York: Free Press.

Roth, G. (1968, January). Personal rulership, patrimonialism and empire-building in the new states. World Politics, 20, 2, 194-206.

Sartori, G. (1970, December). Concept misinformation in comparative politics. American Political Science Review, 64, 1033-1053.

Schramm, W. (1964). Mass media and national development. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Scott, J. (1972, March). Patron-client politics and political change in Southeast Asia. American Political Science Review, 66, 91-114.

Sigal, L. (1979). Reporters and officials. Lexington, Ken.: Heath and Co.

Simmel, G. (1950). The sociology of Georg Simmel, translated and edited by K.H. Wolff. New York: Free Press.

Ugboajah, F. (1980). Communication policies in Nigeria. Paris: UNESCO.

Vasquez, F. (1983). Media economics in the third world. In J.L. Martin & A. Chaudhary (Eds.), Comparative mass media systems (pp. 265-280). New York: Longman.

Weber, M. (1964). The theory of social and economic organizations, edited by T. Parsons and translated by A.M. Henderson and T. Parsons. New York: Free Press.

Weingrod, A. (1968, July). Patrons, patronage and political parties. Comparative Studies in Society and History, 10, 4, 377-400.

Wilcox, D. (1975). Mass media in black Africa. New York: Praeger.

Wolf, E. (1977). Kinship, friendship and patron-client relations in complex societies. In S. Schmidt, L. Guasti, C. Lande & J. Scott (Eds.), Friends, followers and factions (pp. 167-177). Berkeley: University of California Press.